

15. 2014SP-072-001

19TH & BROADWAY MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT

Map 092-16, Parcel(s) 164-165, 167-169

Council District 19 (Erica S. Gilmore)

Staff Reviewer: Lisa Milligan

A request to rezone from MUI-A to SP-MU zoning for properties located at 106 and 108 19th Avenue South and 1810, 1812 and 1814 Broadway, at the northeast corner of 19th Avenue South and Broadway, (1.33 acres), to permit a mixed-use development, requested by Civil Site Design Group, PLLC, applicant; 19th Avenue Properties, G.P., Midtown Properties, LLC, 1810 Broadway Partners, GP, owners.

Staff Recommendation: Approve with conditions and disapprove without all conditions.

APPLICANT REQUEST

Preliminary SP to permit mixed-use development.

Preliminary SP

A request to rezone from Mixed Use Intensive-A (MUI-A) to Specific Plan-Mixed Use (SP-MU) zoning for properties located at 106 and 108 19th Avenue South and 1810, 1812 and 1814 Broadway (1.33 acres), to permit a mixed-use development.

Existing Zoning

Mixed Use Intensive-A (MUI-A) is intended for a high intensity mixture of residential, retail, and office uses and is designed to create walkable neighborhoods through the use of appropriate building placement and bulk standards.

Proposed Zoning

Specific Plan-Mixed Use (SP-MU) is a zoning district category that provides for additional flexibility of design, including the relationship of streets to buildings, to provide the ability to implement the specific details of the General Plan. This Specific Plan includes residential uses in addition to office and/or commercial uses.

CRITICAL PLANNING GOALS

- Supports Infill Development
- Creates Walkable Neighborhoods
- Provides a Range of Housing Choices
- Supports a Variety of Transportation Choices

This proposal meets several critical planning goals. Development in areas with adequate infrastructure is more appropriate than development not served with adequate infrastructure such as roads, water and sewer, because it does not burden Metro with the cost of maintaining new infrastructure. The development will have building entrances along the street frontages and parking placed away from street frontages, improving upon the walkable design of the surrounding streets. The project will replace existing office and retail buildings, intensifying development on an infill site. The proposed multi-family units will provide additional housing choice within the surrounding community. Located along a bus line, the development will add residents to use public transportation and non-residential uses to provide a destination for public transportation users.

The concentration of high density residential, office, restaurant and retail uses will foster walking, biking and the use of public transportation.

GREEN HILLS – MIDTOWN COMMUNITY PLAN

Land Use Policy

Center Mixed Use Neighborhood (T5 MU) policy is intended to preserve and enhance urban mixed use neighborhoods that are characterized by a development pattern that contains a diverse mix of residential and non-residential land uses, and that are envisioned to remain or develop in a mixed use pattern. T5 MU areas are intended to be among the most intense areas in Davidson County. T5 MU areas include the County's major employment centers, representing several sectors of the economy including health care, finance, retail, the music industry, and lodging.

Consistent with Policy?

Yes. The proposed SP zoning district would provide high density residential and supportive structured parking along with hotel and ancillary uses which would support the already diverse mixed use area. The project is proposed to be 25 stories in height. The location of the project in relation to other planned projects as well as the width of Broadway and the creation of a pedestrian friendly streetscape along Broadway supports the proposed height of the building. The proposed development would provide more opportunities for living in the urban core of the city and the hotel and ancillary uses will provide options for people visiting the area.

PLAN DETAILS

The site is located at the northeast corner of 19th Avenue South and Broadway. The site boundaries are Broadway to the South, 19th Avenue to the east and an existing alley to the north. The site is approximately 1.33 acres in size. Current uses on the site consist of small scale office and retail as well as surface parking lots.

Site Plan

The plan proposes a 25-story multi-family residential component and a 16-story hotel component along with structured parking. The multi-family portion includes 270 dwelling units in 300,000 square feet. The hotel includes 220 guest rooms plus ancillary uses in 175,000 square feet. The following bulk standards apply:

Max ISR:	1.0
Max FAR:	9.5
Max Height:	25 stories

Vehicular access is from Broadway and 19th Avenue South. Structure parking is incorporated into the building. The SP will require that the total number of parking spaces comply with Metro requirements for the Urban Zoning Overlay. The plan provides for a 6' frontage zone and 8' sidewalk along the Broadway frontage and a 5 foot frontage zone and 6' sidewalk along the 19th Avenue South frontage. Bicycle parking is being provided to meet the requirements of the Bike Parking Ordinance.

Conceptual elevations have been provided. The building is being pulled up to the street on Broadway and 19th Avenue South. The portion of the building closest to Broadway will be 16-stories maximum in height and the apartment portion will step up to 25-stories maximum. The hotel lobby and a restaurant use are provided along Broadway allowing for a pedestrian friendly streetscape.

ANALYSIS

The plan is consistent with the land use policy and meets several critical planning goals. The plan adds residential units, as well as a hotel with ancillary uses, to an already diverse area.

The Metro Historical Commission staff has recommended disapproval of this project because of a building on the site that is eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. While the concerns of the Historical Commission are well-founded, they must be balanced with the need for development in the Midtown area to be intense enough to support high levels of mass-transit and a strong jobs-housing balance. The inclusion of the property in an Specific Plan allows for design considerations to be addressed leading to a more thoughtful development.

FIRE DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATION

N/A

STORMWATER RECOMMENDATION

Approved

HISTORICAL COMMISSION STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Disapprove

Recommend disapproval as this project would result in the demolition of a National Register Eligible property.

PUBLIC WORKS RECOMMENDATION

Conditions if approved

1. The developer's final construction drawings shall comply with the design regulations established by the Department of Public Works. Final design may vary based on field conditions.
2. ROW should be dedicated to the back of sidewalk. Dedications are required to be recorded prior to the sign off on the building permit.
3. Site should be designed so that doors do not swing into the ROW/ pedestrian zone.
4. Prior to Final SP design the applicant should coordinate with MPW and Metro Planning Staff regarding streetscape design and all elements proposed within the ROW.
5. See traffic engineer comments

TRAFFIC AND PARKING RECOMMENDATION

Conditions if approved

In accordance with the TIS findings,

1. Final SP plan shall include pavement marking plan with documentation of adequate sight distance and turning movements on 19th at intersections between West End and Division St. A full pavement overlay may be required in place of grinding existing pavement markings.
2. Developer shall submit signal plans for West End/ 19th signal modification to Metro traffic engineer for approval and install signal and pavement marking modifications with final SP plan.
3. All Loading, valet and taxi loading operations shall occur on project site. Valet operation shall be designed to prevent queueing into public ROW.

4. Motor court shall be designed to accommodate proposed shuttle service operation.
5. Any recommended on- street parking removal will require application to the T&P operations department.

TIS Conclusions and Recommendations

The 19th and Broadway mixed-use development is proposed to be located on the north side of Broadway east of 19th Avenue South. According to the developer, the proposed development consists of approximately 220 hotel rooms, 270 multi-family units, 3,500 square feet of restaurant space, and a 2,600 square foot rooftop bar. The analyses presented in this study indicate that the impacts of the proposed project on the existing roadway network will be manageable by providing the recommendations below. These specific recommendations will provide safe and efficient traffic operations within the study area following the completion of the proposed project. The recommendations are as follows:

West End Avenue and 19th Avenue

- Provide protected/permitted left turn signal phasing for the northbound approach of 19th Avenue. This will require a modification to the traffic signal to provide a 5-section signal head for left turns.

19th Avenue

- 19th Avenue between West End Avenue and Broadway should be restriped to provide one lane in each direction and a center two-way left turn lane. Each lane should be approximately 10.5 feet in width. The center turn lane will accommodate southbound left turns entering the residential access as well as improve traffic operations for the southbound 19th Avenue approach at Broadway. The restriping on 19th Avenue can be provided by grinding the existing pavement markings and applying the plastic lane lines and pavement markings for the recommended three lane cross-section.
- The southbound approach to Broadway should include approximately 75 feet of dedicated left turn storage and 50 feet of open taper within the center turn lane.
- A left turn arrow pavement marking and a shared through/right turn arrow pavement marking should be provided for the southbound approach. A pedestrian crosswalk on the north leg of 19th Avenue should be provided along with stop line pavement markings.

19th Avenue and Residential Entrance Access

- The residential entrance access should include wayfinding signage to identify that the access is entrance only for residents only.
- If parking/access control equipment is provided, a minimum of 44 feet should be provided between the gate/arm and the back of sidewalk on 19th Avenue. This will ensure adequate space for queuing at the entry gate without spilling into the public right-of-way or impacting the sidewalk accessibility. The parking/access control equipment should be designed with card proximity service or automatic vehicle ID service for residents. If the parking/access control equipment is regulated by a function with a lower service rate such as card insertion, or pushbutton codes for residents, the minimum distance between the entry gate/arm and the back of sidewalk should be re-evaluated.

19th Avenue and Alley #383

- Alley #383 should be widened along the project site to provide 15 feet of right-of-way.
- A westbound arrow pavement marking should be considered for the alley approach to 19th Avenue to supplement the "Do Not Enter" sign and provide additional identification of the one-way designation for the alley.

Broadway and Hotel Access

- The hotel access drive should be designed to include a minimum of one entering lane and one exiting lane.
- The motor court as shown on the site plan will accommodate approximately 8-9 passenger vehicles for valet and hotel check-in. Based on the number of rooms in the hotel and minimal meeting room space, this should accommodate the valet demand for the hotel.
- According to the developer, the hotel may utilize shuttles for guest services. It is anticipated that the shuttles will be passenger vans, which can turn around in the motor court without entering the parking structure.
- If parking/access control equipment is provided, it should be located internal to the parking garage, beyond the motor court to provide sufficient stacking distance between the gate/arm and the back of sidewalk on Broadway. This will ensure adequate space for queuing at the entry gate without spilling into the public right-of-way or impacting the sidewalk accessibility.

19th Avenue and Division Street

- Analyses indicate that the southbound delay and queue could be reduced by providing separate left turn and right turn lanes on 19th Avenue at Division Street. This laneage could be provided on 19th Avenue by extending the recommended three-lane cross-section south to Division Street. However, in order to continue the center turn lane to Division Street, approximately four on-street parking spaces would need to be removed on the east side of 19th Avenue.

Broadway

- In order to increase efficiency of the eastbound traffic flow on Broadway east of the project site, Metro should consider removing the five metered parking spaces on the south side of Broadway at 18th Avenue. Currently, the

metered parking is restricted between 7:00 AM-9:00 AM. Eliminating these five parking spaces would provide a continuous eastbound travel lane on Broadway from west of 19th Avenue to the West End Avenue junction at 16th Avenue. If provided, the restriping on 19th Avenue can be provided by grinding the existing pavement markings and applying the plastic lane lines and pavement markings for the recommended three-lane cross-section.

Parking

- Based on the proposed number of apartment units in the preliminary SP zoning request, approximately 280 parking spaces are needed to accommodate the residential use per the Metro zoning ordinance for the Urban Zoning Overlay (UZO). At a minimum, the number of spaces provided in the residential garage should meet the base UZO requirements with a maximum of 10% reduction for transit access.
- Based on the proposed number of hotel rooms and restaurant/bar space in the preliminary SP zoning request, approximately 152 parking spaces are needed to accommodate the commercial uses per the Metro zoning ordinance and market demand for urban hotels in Nashville. At a minimum, the number of spaces provided in the hotel garage should accommodate 0.50 spaces per hotel room, which is consistent with market demand for urban hotels both in Nashville and in other cities. The hotel garage should also include 1 space per 4 employees as required by the UZO parking demand rates for hotels. In addition to the hotel parking demand, the hotel garage should include the number of spaces needed to meet the base UZO requirements for restaurant/bar space without any additional reductions allowed for transit and pedestrian access or any other reductions.

In summary, based on the analyses conducted, no further recommendations are presented for the proposed 19th and Broadway mixed-use development.

Maximum Uses in Existing Zoning District: MUI-A

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
Retail (820)	1.33	5.0 F	289,674 SF	13,558	289	1,298

Maximum Uses in Proposed Zoning District: SP-R

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
Multi-Family Residential (220)	1.33	-	270 U	1,760	137	167

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
Hotel (310)	1.33	-	220 U	1,963	142	138

Traffic changes between maximum: MUI-A and SP-R

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
-	-	-	-	-9,835	-10	-993

METRO SCHOOL BOARD REPORT

Projected student generation existing MUI-A district: 1 Elementary 1 Middle 2 High

Projected student generation proposed SP-MU district: 1 Elementary 1 Middle 2 High

The proposed SP-MU zoning district would not generate any additional students than would be generated from the existing zoning. This information is based upon data from the school board last updated September 2013.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve with conditions and disapprove without all conditions.

CONDITIONS

1. Permitted land uses shall be limited to multi-family residential, hotel, restaurant, bar and all other uses in MUI-A. Multi-family residential shall be limited to up to 270 units.
2. Finalized elevations shall be submitted with the final site plan. Elevations must be consistent with the Conceptual Perspective Rendering on sheet A-104 and the Concept Imagery on Sheet A-105.
3. Sidewalk widths shall be as per the adopted Major and Collector Street Plan. The final site plan shall show the following: 4 foot frontage/planting zone and 10 foot sidewalk on Broadway; 4 foot frontage/planting zone and 10 foot sidewalk on 19th Avenue South.
4. With the submittal of a corrected copy, update the parking table to reflect the parking ratios specified in the Traffic Impact Study.
5. Comply with the requirements of Public Works in regards for traffic.
6. For any development standards, regulations and requirements not specifically shown on the SP plan and/or included as a condition of Council approval, the property shall be subject to the standards, regulations and requirements of the MUI-A zoning district as of the date of the application request or application.
7. A corrected copy of the preliminary SP plan incorporating the conditions of approval by the Metro Council shall be provided to the Planning Commission prior to or with the final site plan application.
8. Minor modifications to the preliminary SP plan may be approved by the Planning Commission or its designee based upon final architectural, engineering, or site design and actual site conditions. All modifications shall be consistent with the principles and further the objectives of the approved plan. Modifications shall not be permitted, except through an ordinance approved by Metro Council that increase the permitted density or floor area, add uses not otherwise permitted, eliminate specific conditions or requirements contained in the plan as adopted through this enacting ordinance, or add vehicular access points not currently present or approved.
9. The requirements of the Metro Fire Marshal's Office for emergency vehicle access and adequate water supply for fire protection must be met prior to the issuance of any building permits.

Ms. Milligan presented the staff recommendation of approval with conditions and disapproval without all conditions.

Larry Papel, 4320 Signal Hill Drive, spoke in favor of the application, noted that the project is very suitable to the current plan and that it meets all critical planning goals, and clarified that this is a zoning request, not a demolition request.

Hal Clark, Civil Site Design, spoke in favor of the application.

Robbie Jones, 839 Seymour Ave, spoke in opposition of the application because it would require the demolition of a National Register Eligible property. He stated that he would like to see the home incorporated into the development.

Mr. Bernhardt noted that the current zoning does not prevent demolition of this property.

Matt Schutz, 605 S 10th Street, spoke in opposition to the application and noted that it creates too many curb cuts rather than utilizing the existing alley.

Brian (last name unclear), 444 Elmington, spoke in opposition to the application and stated that it will be a big loss to the community if demolition is allowed to occur.

Larry Papel reminded the commission that the hearing is regarding zoning, not demolition.

Chairman McLean closed the Public Hearing.

Mr. Gee stated that he feels obligated to encourage and help protect our historic resources and noted that there are tools the commission may have to make hard decisions on to protect some of these structures. He also stated that this design/plan is exactly what we all have envisioned for Midtown.

Ms. Blackshear stated that this is a development that would be ideal for this location although it's unfortunate that the commission doesn't have the ability to protect the home.

Councilman Hunt stated that he was struggling with it, but leans toward supporting staff recommendation.

Ms. Farr spoke in favor of the development but would like to find a way to preserve the home.

Chairman McLean inquired if there was any way to incorporate the structure or a portion of the structure into the design.

Mr. Papel noted that there are practical reasons such as underground parking why the entire house or even a significant portion could not survive.

Mr. Gee moved and Ms. LeQuire seconded the motion to approve with conditions and disapprove without all

conditions, including a condition that the developer work with the Executive Director of the Metro Historic Zoning Commission to consider the possibility of relocating the historic structure or, if demolition is approved, of salvaging and incorporating materials from the historic structure if practicable. (6-0)

Resolution No. RS2014-266

"BE IT RESOLVED by The Metropolitan Planning Commission that 2014SP-072-001 is **Approved with conditions and disapproved without all conditions, including a condition that the developer work with the Executive Director of the Metro Historic Zoning Commission to consider the possibility of relocating the historic structure or, if demolition is approved, of salvaging and incorporating materials from the historic structure if practicable. (6-0)**"

CONDITIONS

1. Permitted land uses shall be limited to multi-family residential, hotel, restaurant, bar and all other uses in MUI-A. Multi-family residential shall be limited to up to 270 units.
 2. Finalized elevations shall be submitted with the final site plan. Elevations must be consistent with the Conceptual Perspective Rendering on sheet A-104 and the Concept Imagery on Sheet A-105.
 3. Sidewalk widths shall be as per the adopted Major and Collector Street Plan. The final site plan shall show the following: 4 foot frontage/planting zone and 10 foot sidewalk on Broadway; 4 foot frontage/planting zone and 10 foot sidewalk on 19th Avenue South.
 4. With the submittal of a corrected copy, update the parking table to reflect the parking ratios specified in the Traffic Impact Study.
 5. Comply with the requirements of Public Works in regards for traffic.
 6. For any development standards, regulations and requirements not specifically shown on the SP plan and/or included as a condition of Council approval, the property shall be subject to the standards, regulations and requirements of the MUI-A zoning district as of the date of the application request or application.
 7. A corrected copy of the preliminary SP plan incorporating the conditions of approval by the Metro Council shall be provided to the Planning Commission prior to or with the final site plan application.
 8. Minor modifications to the preliminary SP plan may be approved by the Planning Commission or its designee based upon final architectural, engineering, or site design and actual site conditions. All modifications shall be consistent with the principles and further the objectives of the approved plan. Modifications shall not be permitted, except through an ordinance approved by Metro Council that increase the permitted density or floor area, add uses not otherwise permitted, eliminate specific conditions or requirements contained in the plan as adopted through this enacting ordinance, or add vehicular access points not currently present or approved.
 9. The requirements of the Metro Fire Marshal's Office for emergency vehicle access and adequate water supply for fire protection must be met prior to the issuance of any building permits.
-