

2015SP-069-001

SHELBY WOODS SP

Map 094-05, Parcel(s) 106

Council District 06 (Peter Westerholm)

Staff Reviewer: Lisa Milligan

A request to rezone from RS5 to SP-MR zoning for property located at Davidson Street (unnumbered), approximately 300 feet east of S 14th Street, (9.65 acres), to permit up to 110 multi-family units accessed from Davidson Street and up to 39 detached residential units accessed from Village Court, for a total of up to 149 units, requested by Smith Gee Studio, LLC, applicant; Upside, LLC, owner.

Staff Recommendation: Approve with conditions and disapprove without all conditions.

APPLICANT REQUEST

Preliminary SP to permit up to 149 residential dwelling units.

Preliminary SP

A request to rezone from Single-Family Residential (RS5) to Specific Plan-Mixed Residential (SP-MR) zoning for property located at Davidson Street (unnumbered), approximately 300 feet east of S 14th Street, (9.65 acres), to permit up to 110 multi-family residential units accessed from Davidson Street and up to 39 detached residential units accessed from Village Court, for a total of up to 149 units.

Existing Zoning

Single-Family Residential (RS5) requires a minimum 5,000 square foot lot and is intended for single-family dwellings at a density of 7.41 dwelling units per acre. *RS5 would permit a maximum of 84 units.*

Proposed Zoning

Specific Plan-Mixed Residential (SP-MR) is a zoning district category that provides for additional flexibility of design, including the relationship of streets to buildings, to provide the ability to implement the specific details of the General Plan. This Specific Plan includes a mixture of housing types.

CRITICAL PLANNING GOALS

- Creates Walkable Neighborhoods
- Supports Infill Development
- Preserves Sensitive Environmental Features
- Provides a Range of Housing Choices

This proposal meets several critical planning goals. Development in areas with adequate infrastructure is more appropriate than development not served with adequate infrastructure such as roads, water and sewer, because it does not burden Metro with the cost of maintaining new infrastructure. The site is located within the 100-year floodplain. The project allows for the intensification of an infill site while also preserving the majority of the site to minimize the impact on the sensitive environmental features. Both single-family and multi-family housing units are proposed which provides a range of housing options. Sidewalks are proposed along Davidson Street as well as in the northern portion of the development creating a more pedestrian friendly and walkable neighborhood. Additionally, a trail connector is planned to connect the northern and southern portions of the development and to Shelby Park which is located adjacent to the site.

EAST NASHVILLE COMMUNITY PLAN

Current Policy

T4 Urban Neighborhood Maintenance (T4 NM) policy is intended to preserve the general character of urban neighborhoods as characterized by their development pattern, building form, land use and associated public realm. T4 NM areas will experience some change over time, primarily when buildings are expanded or replaced. When this occurs, efforts should be made to retain the existing character of the neighborhood, in terms of its development pattern, building form, land use and the public realm. Where not present, enhancements are made to improve pedestrian, bicycle and vehicular connectivity.

Conservation (CO) policy is intended to preserve and enhance environmentally sensitive land within all Transect Categories except T6 Downtown. CO policy identifies land with sensitive environmental features including, but not limited to, steep slopes, floodway/floodplains, rare or special plant or animal habitats, wetlands and unstable or problem soils.

Growth and Preservation Concept Map

T4 Urban Neighborhood Maintenance (T4 NM) policy is intended to preserve the general character of urban neighborhoods as characterized by their development pattern, building form, land use and associated public realm. T4 NM areas will experience some change over time, primarily when buildings are expanded or replaced. When this occurs, efforts should be made to retain the existing character of the neighborhood, in terms of its development

pattern, building form, land use and the public realm. Where not present, enhancements are made to improve pedestrian, bicycle and vehicular connectivity.

T4 Urban Neighborhood Evolving (T4 NE) policy is intended to create and enhance urban neighborhoods that are compatible with the general character of existing urban neighborhoods as characterized by their development pattern, building form, land use and associated public realm, with opportunities for housing choice and improved pedestrian, bicycle and vehicular connectivity. The resulting development pattern may have higher densities than existing urban neighborhoods and/or smaller lots sizes, with a broader range of housing types providing housing choice. This reflects the scarcity of easily developable land (without sensitive environmental features) and the cost of developing housing.

Conservation (CO) policy is intended to preserve and enhance environmentally sensitive land within all Transect Categories except T6 Downtown. CO policy identifies land with sensitive environmental features including, but not limited to, steep slopes, floodway/floodplains, rare or special plant or animal habitats, wetlands and unstable or problem soils.

Consistent with Policy?

Yes. A large portion of the site is located within the Conservation policy. A portion of the northern site is located in T4 Urban Neighborhood Maintenance and a portion of the southern site is located in T4 Urban Neighborhood Evolving. The multi-family units are situated along Davidson Street, where the policy is Neighborhood Evolving and Conservation. The siting of the building is intended to limit the amount of disturbance while enhancing the streetscape along Davidson Street. The units located in the northern portion of the site are also planned in a way to minimize disturbance. The majority of the northern units are proposed to be built on piers allowing for the units to be tucked into the existing trees and minimizing the disturbance of the floodplain areas.

PLAN DETAILS

The site is located on the north side of Davidson Street, west of S 14th Street and east of Shelby Park. The site is approximately 9.65 acres in size and is currently vacant.

Site Plan

The plan proposed up to 149 residential dwelling units including 110 multi-family stacked flat units on the southern portion of the site and 39 single-family detached units on the northern portion of the site. The plan will meet the requirements of the Zoning Code in regards to parking and will also be required to provide bicycle parking consistent with the requirements of the adopted Bicycle Parking Ordinance.

The southern portion of the site is proposed for a 110 unit stacked flat building. The building will include a mixture of studio, 1-bedroom, and 2-bedroom units along with an interior amenity space. Vehicular access to the building is from Davidson Street to a proposed underground parking garage. The building is setback from Davidson Street a maximum of 40 feet. This allows for the underground parking to be less visible than if the building was located closer to the street. The proposed setback also allows for the preservation of large existing trees and provides for a transition to the park area to the east of the site.

The maximum height of the stacked flat building is 3 stories in 45 feet, measured from finished floor to top of eave. Architectural standards have been provided as follows:

- Buildings shall avoid continuous uninterrupted blank facades. At a minimum, the façade plan shall be interrupted by one of the following for every 30 linear feet of street frontage:
 - A change in building material
 - A horizontal undulation in the building
 - A porch, stoop or balcony
 - Street facing building facades shall have a minimum of 15% glazing
 - Raised foundation of 18" to 36" required.

The northern site proposes up to 39 single-family units. The units will be a mixture of garage loaded units (6) and elevated units (33). Access to the northern site is from an existing stub of Village Court. A private drive is proposed to run from Village Court through the site. The development of the northern site is limited to primarily the portion of the site closest to the northern property line, adjacent to the existing homes off of Village Court and Electric Avenue. The garage loaded units will have shared driveways between units for a total of 3 driveways, each driveway accessing 2 units. The garages will be side loaded off of the driveway. Parking for the elevated units is located along the private drive.

The elevated units are proposed to be primarily constructed in groupings of units that are accessed by raised walkways with shared elevated decks. The units are proposed to be constructed on piers allowing for minimum disturbance of the floodplain areas. The graphic below shows an example of how the elevated units would be accessed from the private drive. The graphic is for one of the individual elevated units.

The elevated units are proposed to have a maximum height of 3 stories in 36 feet, measured from finish floor to the top of eave. The garage loaded units will have raised foundations of 18" to 36".

The applicant has indicated that only a minimum amount of the site will be disturbed, as needed for the private drive to the north and the construction of the stacked flats building on the southern portion of the site. A series of constructed wetlands are proposed in the central area of the site. This area had previously been disturbed for construction of sewer line extensions.

Sidewalks are proposed to be constructed along Davidson Street and tie into the proposed bike track that is being constructed along Davidson Street by Metro Public Works. Sidewalks are also proposed in the northern portion of the site. A trail will connect the northern and southern areas and will also connect the overall development to Shelby Park.

ANALYSIS

The plan is consistent with the T4 Urban Neighborhood Maintenance Policy, T4 Urban Neighborhood Evolving Policy, and the Conservation policy in that the plan is providing for a mixture of residential units on an infill site while allowing for minimal disturbance of the sensitive environmental areas.

FIRE DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATION

Approved with conditions

- Fire Code issues for the structures will be addressed at permit application review.
- Hydrants shall be located within 500' of all parts of every structure via approved hard-surfaced roads.

STORMWATER RECOMMENDATION

Conditions if approved

- No structure shall reside within any public utility and drainage easements.
- Cut / Fill compensation will be required.
- All structures shall be built to MWS Stormwater floodplain requirements.

WATER SERVICES

Approved with conditions

- As the unit count in the updated availability study (149 total units) matches the SP plans, we recommend approval. Public construction plans must be submitted and approved prior to Final SP approval. Also, the required capacity fee must be paid prior to Final SP approval.

PUBLIC WORKS RECOMMENDATION

Approve with conditions

- The developer's final construction drawings shall comply with the design regulations established by the Department of Public Works. Final design may vary based on field conditions.
- Comply with the conditions of the MPW Traffic Engineer
- Indicate the location of the dumpster and recycling container(s) for both portions of the project.
- Indicate the construction of ST-200 curb and gutter, 4' grass strip, and ST-210 sidewalk along Davidson, all within dedicated ROW.

TRAFFIC AND PARKING RECOMMENDATION

Conditions if approved

- An Access study will be required for multi-family section on Davidson St prior to Final SP.
- Provide adequate sight distance at proposed driveway.
- Provide parking per Metro code.

Maximum Uses in Existing Zoning District: **RS5**

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
Single-Family Residential (210)	9.65	8.71 D	84 U	886	69	92

Maximum Uses in Proposed Zoning District: **SP-R**

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
Multi-Family Residential (220)	9.65	-	149 U	1027	77	100

Traffic changes between maximum: **RS5** and **SP-R**

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
-	-	-	-	+141	+8	+8

METRO SCHOOL BOARD REPORT

Projected student generation existing RS5 district: 1 Elementary 1 Middle 1 High

Projected student generation proposed SP-MR district: 13 Elementary 6 Middle 5 High

The proposed SP-MR zoning district could generate 21 more students than what is typically generated under the existing RS5 zoning district. Students would attend Kirkpatrick Elementary School, Bailey Middle School, and Stratford High School. All three schools have been identified as having additional capacity. This information is based upon data from the school board last updated October 2014.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval with conditions and disapproval without all conditions.

CONDITIONS

1. Permitted land uses shall be limited to up to 110 multi-family residential units accessed from Davidson Street and up to 34 detached residential units, accessed from Village Court, unless the floodplain is revised by FEMA then 39 single-family residential units may be allowed.
2. On the corrected set, revise the architectural standards section to specify that façade plane interruptions are required for the stacked flat units.
3. On the corrected set, revise all references to raised foundations as follows: Raised foundations a minimum of 18" and a maximum of 36" are required for all residential units, except for units on piers.
4. On the corrected set, update the fallback zoning district to RM15.
5. On the corrected set, update the permitted uses as follows: Permitted uses are limited to up to 110 multi-family residential units accessed from Davidson Street and up to 34 detached residential units, accessed from Village Court, unless the floodplain is revised by FEMA then 39 single-family residential units may be allowed.
6. Elevations consistent with the architectural standards and concept imagery must be provided with the submittal of the Final SP for staff approval. If staff finds that the elevations are not consistent with the imagery, Planning Commission approval may be required.
7. Provide a detailed tree survey and tree removal plan with the submittal of the Final SP.
8. Provide a final grading plan with the submittal of the Final SP. Grading plan must be consistent with preliminary grading plan submitted with Preliminary SP.
9. Provide a detailed landscaping plan with the submittal of the Final SP.
10. Bicycle parking shall be provided consistent with the requirements of the bicycle parking ordinance.
11. Signage is limited to the stacked flat building and only 1 ground sign is allowed.
12. Final signage design must be submitted with the Final SP and is subject to approval by Planning Staff.
13. The final site plan shall meet the conditions of Metro Public Works and Traffic and Parking.
14. The Preliminary SP plan is the site plan and associated documents. If applicable, remove all notes and references that indicate that the site plan is illustrative, conceptual, etc.
15. For any development standards, regulations and requirements not specifically shown on the SP plan and/or included as a condition of Council approval, the property shall be subject to the standards, regulations and requirements of the RM15 zoning district as of the date of the application request or application.
16. A corrected copy of the preliminary SP plan incorporating the conditions of approval by the Metro Council shall be provided to the Planning Commission prior to or with the final site plan application.
17. Minor modifications to the preliminary SP plan may be approved by the Planning Commission or its designee based upon final architectural, engineering, or site design and actual site conditions. All modifications shall be consistent with the principles and further the objectives of the approved plan. Modifications shall not be permitted, except through an ordinance approved by Metro Council that increase the permitted density or floor area, add uses not otherwise permitted, eliminate specific conditions or requirements contained in the plan as adopted through this enacting ordinance, or add vehicular access points not currently present or approved.
18. The requirements of the Metro Fire Marshal's Office for emergency vehicle access and adequate water supply for fire protection must be met prior to the issuance of any building permits.

Ms. Milligan presented the staff recommendation of approval with conditions and disapproval without all conditions.

Scott Morton, Smite Gee Studio, spoke in favor of the application and noted that there are over nine acres of tree canopy and undisturbed land.

Michael Garrigan, 516 Heather Place, spoke in favor of the application and noted that while the property is in the flood

plain, they've worked very hard to work around that. The majority of the mature trees on site will be preserved.

March Egerton spoke in favor of the application.

Joe Newmaier, 1405 Davidson St, spoke in favor of the application and stated that it's an exciting project that is good for the city.

Linda Gorrell, 901 Village Ct, spoke in opposition to the application due to flooding concerns.

Thomas Priestley, 1426 Electric Ave, spoke in opposition to the application due to flooding concerns and setting a precedent for future developments.

Brent Perry, 1418 Electric Ave, spoke in opposition to the application due to flooding, traffic, and sewage concerns.

Tommy Simmons, 713 S 14th St, spoke in opposition to the application due to traffic concerns.

Chris Warrick, 1430 Electric Ave, spoke in opposition to the application due to traffic and noise concerns.

Michael Garrison requested approval.

Chairman McLean closed the Public Hearing.

Ms. Farr spoke in favor of staff recommendation.

Ms. Blackshear asked to hear from Metro Storm Water.

Steve Mishu, Metro Storm Water, stated that this does meet the regulations. For every one truck of fill put in the floodplain, at least one truck will be taken out. There will be no lost floodplain storage on this property.

Ms. LeQuire expressed excitement about the project and stated that it is everything she's been asking for.

Ms. LeQuire moved and Ms. Farr seconded the motion to approve with conditions and disapprove without all conditions. (6-0)

Resolution No. RS2015-203

"BE IT RESOLVED by The Metropolitan Planning Commission that 2015SP-069-001 is **Approved with conditions and disapproved without all conditions. (6-0)**"

CONDITIONS

- 1. Permitted land uses shall be limited to up to 110 multi-family residential units accessed from Davidson Street and up to 34 detached residential units, accessed from Village Court, unless the floodplain is revised by FEMA then 39 single-family residential units may be allowed.**
- 2. On the corrected set, revise the architectural standards section to specify that façade plane interruptions are required for the stacked flat units.**
- 3. On the corrected set, revise all references to raised foundations as follows: Raised foundations a minimum of 18" and a maximum of 36" are required for all residential units, except for units on piers.**
- 4. On the corrected set, update the fallback zoning district to RM15.**
- 5. On the corrected set, update the permitted uses as follows: Permitted uses are limited to up to 110 multi-family residential units accessed from Davidson Street and up to 34 detached residential units, accessed from Village Court, unless the floodplain is revised by FEMA then 39 single-family residential units may be allowed.**
- 6. Elevations consistent with the architectural standards and concept imagery must be provided with the submittal of the Final SP for staff approval. If staff finds that the elevations are not consistent with the imagery, Planning Commission approval may be required.**
- 7. Provide a detailed tree survey and tree removal plan with the submittal of the Final SP.**
- 8. Provide a final grading plan with the submittal of the Final SP. Grading plan must be consistent with preliminary grading plan submitted with Preliminary SP.**
- 9. Provide a detailed landscaping plan with the submittal of the Final SP.**
- 10. Bicycle parking shall be provided consistent with the requirements of the bicycle parking ordinance.**
- 11. Signage is limited to the stacked flat building and only 1 ground sign is allowed.**
- 12. Final signage design must be submitted with the Final SP and is subject to approval by Planning Staff.**
- 13. The final site plan shall meet the conditions of Metro Public Works and Traffic and Parking.**
- 14. The Preliminary SP plan is the site plan and associated documents. If applicable, remove all notes and references that indicate that the site plan is illustrative, conceptual, etc.**
- 15. For any development standards, regulations and requirements not specifically shown on the SP plan and/or included as a condition of Council approval, the property shall be subject to the standards, regulations and requirements of the RM15 zoning district as of the date of the application request or application.**

16. A corrected copy of the preliminary SP plan incorporating the conditions of approval by the Metro Council shall be provided to the Planning Commission prior to or with the final site plan application.

17. Minor modifications to the preliminary SP plan may be approved by the Planning Commission or its designee based upon final architectural, engineering, or site design and actual site conditions. All modifications shall be consistent with the principles and further the objectives of the approved plan. Modifications shall not be permitted, except through an ordinance approved by Metro Council that increase the permitted density or floor area, add uses not otherwise permitted, eliminate specific conditions or requirements contained in the plan as adopted through this enacting ordinance, or add vehicular access points not currently present or approved.

18. The requirements of the Metro Fire Marshal's Office for emergency vehicle access and adequate water supply for fire protection must be met prior to the issuance of any building permits.
