2016SP-024-001

MCGAVOCK HOUSE SP
BL2016-204\S. Davis
Map 082-03, Parcel(s) 218, 227-229, 231, 415-417, 551
Council District 05 (Scott Davis)
Staff Reviewer: Lisa Milligan

A request to rezone from RS5 and SP to SP-MU zoning for properties located at 206 Vaughn Street and 900, 901, 902, 903, and 908 Meridian Street and 219, 307, and 309 Cleveland Street, north of Cleveland Street (3.23 acres), to permit a mixed use development, requested by Hastings Architecture, applicant; Trinii Enterprises, LLC, Betty Jo Saxon, and Ray of Hope Community Church, owners. (See also Community Plan Amendment 2016CP-005-001).
Staff Recommendation: Approve with conditions and disapprove without all conditions if the associated plan amendment is approved. Disapprove if the associated plan amendment is not approved.

APPLICANT REQUEST
Zone change to permit a mixed use development.

Preliminary SP
A request to rezone from Single-Family Residential (RS5) and Specific Plan (SP) to Specific Plan-Mixed Use (SP-MU) zoning for properties located at 206 Vaughn Street and 900, 901, 902, 903, and 908 Meridian Street and 219, 307, and 309 Cleveland Street, north of Cleveland Street (3.23 acres), to permit a mixed use development.

Existing Zoning
Single-Family Residential (RS5) requires a minimum 5,000 square foot lot and is intended for single-family dwellings at a density of 7.41 dwelling units per acre. *RS5 would permit a maximum of 13 units.*

Specific Plan-Residential (SP-R) is a zoning district category that provides for additional flexibility of design, including the relationship of streets to buildings, to provide the ability to implement the specific details of the General Plan. This Specific Plan allows for uses as permitted by RS5 as well as detached accessory dwelling units.

Proposed Zoning
Specific Plan – Mixed Use (SP-MU) is a zoning district category that provides for additional flexibility of design, including the relationship of streets to buildings, to provide the ability to implement the specific details of the General Plan. This Specific Plan includes residential uses in addition to commercial and light industrial uses.

CRITICAL PLANNING GOALS
- Supports Infill Development
- Creates Walkable Neighborhoods
- Supports a Variety of Transportation Choices
- Preserves Historic Resources

The proposed development meets several critical planning goals. Development in areas with adequate infrastructure is more appropriate than development in areas not served with adequate infrastructure such as roads, water and sewer, because it does not burden Metro with the cost of maintaining new infrastructure. The project proposes development on an infill site. The proposed mixture of uses creates a destination for existing neighborhood residents providing for an opportunity to walk or bike to the center. There is an existing bus route along Cleveland Street and Meridian Street allowing for a variety of transportation choices for future residents. Bicycle parking is also being provided. The SP plan proposes to reuse the Historic Landmark District McGavock House and the National Register Eligible religious institution, providing for preservation of historic resources.

EAST NASHVILLE COMMUNITY PLAN
Current Policy
T4 Urban Neighborhood Maintenance (T4 NM) is intended to preserve the general character of existing urban residential neighborhoods. T4 NM areas will experience some change over time, primarily when buildings are expanded or replaced. When this occurs, efforts should be made to retain the existing character of the neighborhood. T4 NM areas are served by high levels of connectivity with complete street networks, sidewalks, bikeways and existing or planned mass transit. Enhancements may be made to improve pedestrian, bicycle and vehicular connectivity.

T4 Urban Neighborhood Evolving (T4 NE) is intended to create and enhance urban residential neighborhoods that provide more housing choices, improved pedestrian, bicycle and vehicular connectivity, and moderate to high density development patterns with shallow setbacks and minimal spacing between buildings. T4 NE areas are served by high levels of connectivity with complete street networks, sidewalks, bikeways and existing or planned mass transit. T4 NE policy may be applied either to undeveloped or substantially under-developed "greenfield" areas or to developed areas where redevelopment and infill produce a different character that includes increased housing diversity and connectivity. Successful infill and redevelopment in existing neighborhoods needs to take into account considerations

such as timing and some elements of the existing developed character, such as the street network and block structure and proximity to centers and corridors.

Proposed Policy
T4 Urban Neighborhood Center (T4 NC) is intended to preserve, enhance, and create urban neighborhood centers that serve urban neighborhoods that are generally within a 5 minute walk. T4 NC areas are pedestrian friendly areas generally located at intersections of urban streets that contain commercial, mixed use, residential, and institutional land uses. Infrastructure and transportation networks may be enhanced to improve pedestrian, bicycle and vehicular connectivity.

Special Policies
Any zoning changes within this T4 NC area must be to a design-based zoning district that:
- Ensures the preservation of any structures and their settings within the area that are classified as listed in the National Register of Historic Places (NR), National Register Eligible (NRE), or local Historic Landmark (HL);
- Ensures that any new development or redevelopment of properties that are adjacent to any historically significant features classified as listed above protects the historic integrity of those features;
- Strongly encourages the preservation of any other contributing structures to the Cleveland Park Historic District;
- Provides appropriate transitions in scale, massing, building orientation, and site design to surrounding properties in residential policy areas;
- Limits the use of properties that are adjacent to residential policy areas to residential and/or small office uses that are limited in height to two stories in 35 feet and that generate minimal parking demand;
- Results in no additional property access along the street frontages of the Special Policy Area;
- Provides appropriate on-site transitions to surrounding properties in residential policy areas through measures such as landscape buffering and distance between structures.

Consistent with Policy?
The proposed SP is not consistent with the existing T4 Urban Neighborhood Maintenance and T4 Urban Neighborhood Evolving policy as both policies support only residential and institutional uses and would not support the non-residential uses that are proposed. The SP is consistent with the proposed T4 Urban Neighborhood Center policy and the proposed Special Policies. The SP includes a mixture of uses that would serve the surrounding residential neighborhood and provide opportunities for existing and future residents to walk to the center for goods and services. There are existing sidewalks along both Meridian Street and Cleveland Street and the proposed uses will enhance the walkability of the area by creating a destination. Care has been taken to preserve the existing National Register and National Register Eligible resources and create a plan that provide appropriate transitions and protects the integrity of the historic resources.

PLAN DETAILS
The site is located at 206 Vaughn Street and 900, 901, 902, 903, and 908 Meridian Street and 219, 307, and 309 Cleveland Street, north of Cleveland Street at the intersection of Cleveland Street and Meridian Street. The site is approximately 3.23 acres in size and is used as a church and associated parking as well as single-family residential homes. All properties included within the SP have been noted as being within the Cleveland Park National Register Eligible District. However, only the McGavock House, church building, and historic rock walls have been determined to be contributing to the district. The McGavock House is designated as a local Historic Landmark and the church building is noted also as being individually eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places.

Site Plan
The plan proposes a mixed use development. The plan proposes to reuse the existing church building and administration building located on the northeast corner of the intersection of Cleveland Street and Meridian Street. The plan also proposes to reuse the McGavock House, which is designated as a Historic Landmark District.

The plan is broken into four subdistricts. Subdistrict A is located on the northwest corner of the intersection of Cleveland Street and Meridian Street. There are currently three single-family structures located on the lots making up Subdistrict A. These three homes have been noted as being worthy of conservation. Subdistrict A proposes up to 20 multi-family dwelling units and up to 2,000 square feet of non-residential uses. The non-residential permitted uses include restaurant, retail, or office. Parking is provided within garage spaces for the residential units. The units are proposed to front Meridian Street, Cleveland Street, and toward the McGavock House historic structure. Heights for the units facing the historic house are proposed at a maximum of 2.5 stories in 36 feet, with a stepback after the second story before going up to the maximum allowable height. Heights for the units facing Cleveland Street and Meridian Street are proposed at 3 stories in 36 feet, not including enclosed stair cases for roof access which bring the total height to 48 feet. A landscape buffer is proposed between the proposed drive off Cleveland Street and the residential property immediately adjacent to the west. Landscaping is also proposed between the units and the McGavock House.

Subdistrict B is located on the northeast corner of the intersection of Cleveland Street and Meridian Street. This subdistrict is primarily comprised of the existing church and administration buildings along with associated parking. The plan proposes to reuse both buildings for a variety of uses that could include up to 50 multi-family residential units,

restaurant, a bed and breakfast inn, hotel, community education, office, and retail uses. Subdistrict B includes the majority of the parking to serve the entire SP. Parking is provided north and east of the existing buildings. Landscape buffers have been provided between the parking areas and the existing residential uses to the north and east. A large open space has been provided at the corner to create a gathering place and focal point for the development. There is currently surface parking for the church located in this area.

Subdistrict C is the site of the McGavock House which is designated as a local Historic Landmark District. The plan proposes to reuse the house with allowed uses including restaurant, a bed and breakfast inn, and office. A series of sidewalks are proposed to create connectivity around the McGavock House and enhance the large open space in front of the house.

Subdistrict D is located along Vaughn Street and is proposed as a newly constructed accessory building. Two parking spaces and a loading zone are also included on the site. The parking and the loading zoned are located behind the proposed building. The proposed uses include accessory uses, such as storage and production, for the uses located within the McGavock House. These uses may include food and beverage production, food and beverage storage, ancillary office, laundry, and storage of goods and furnishings.

There are three proposed vehicular access point throughout the SP: one access point on Vaughn Street, one access point on Cleveland Street west of Meridian Street and one access point on Cleveland Street east of Meridian Street. Access is also provided from an existing alley east of Meridian Street. A portion of the alley running from north to south is proposed to be closed. Also, a portion of alley on the west side of Meridian Street is proposed to be closed. This alley is a dead end alley and provides no connection. There are existing sidewalks along Meridian Street and Cleveland Street. Most of the frontage along Meridian Street and Cleveland Street includes an existing historic rock wall. The preservation of this wall precludes increasing the width of the sidewalk or grass strip. Where possible along Cleveland Street, the sidewalks will be improved to meet the Major and Collector Street plan standards.

ANALYSIS
The proposed development provides for an urban development on an infill site and creates a neighborhood center to serve an existing residential neighborhood. The proposed mixture of uses provides an opportunity for current and future residents to walk to the center for goods and services. The plan reuses the historic McGavock House and the historic church and is designed in a way that is respectful of the historic buildings. The open space in front of the McGavock House is being improved to provide for a centralized gathering place and focal point. A large green space is also proposed on the northeast corner of the intersection. The Historic Zoning Commission has reviewed the SP as the McGavock House is a Historic Landmark District and the Commission recommended approval with conditions.

HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION
Approve with conditions
- The portions of the development closest to the historic buildings be decreased in size and that the applicant shall work with MHZC to determine the appropriate heights.
- The three homes at the corner of Cleveland and Meridian Streets be documented following MHC's documentation standards. Salvage of architectural features of the three dwellings is encouraged.
- Construction fencing be utilized during construction to protect the historic stone wall.
- Exterior alterations to the Ray of Hope Community Church are reviewed by MHZC Staff.

FIRE MARSHAL RECOMMENDATION
Approve with conditions
- Fire Code issues for the structures will be addressed at permit application review.

STORMWATER RECOMMENDATION
Approve

WATER SERVICES RECOMMENDATION
Approve with conditions
- Approved as a Preliminary SP only. Public sewer construction plans must be submitted and approved prior to Final SP approval. These approved construction plans must match the Final Site Plan/SP plans. The required capacity fees must also be paid prior to Final Site Plan/SP approval.

PUBLIC WORKS RECOMMENDATION
Approve with conditions
- The developer's final construction drawings shall comply with the design regulations established by the Department of Public Works. Final design may vary based on field conditions.
- As shown the entire alley #328 would have to be abandoned. All "affected" owners must sign the abandonment. The abandonment is to be submitted prior to the Final SP. If the alley is not abandoned, then the preliminary SP will need to be abandoned.
- Indicate on the plan that alley #330 and #333 along the property frontage are to be built to ½ MPW standard ST-263 from the existing centerline of alley ROW.

• If sidewalks are to be widened they are to meet MPW standards and specifications, coordinate with MPW and MPC on whether sidewalks are required to be widened.

TRAFFIC AND PARKING RECOMMENDATION
Conditions if approved
TIS Conclusions and Recommendations

• As currently planned, the parking that is proposed for the McGavock House development exceeds the parking requirements set forth by the Metro Nashville Code of Ordinances. Therefore, more than adequate parking is proposed for the project.
• Given the minimal amount of traffic added by the proposed McGavock House development, the lack of site access onto Meridian Street, and its current utilization by neighboring residents, the on-street parking on both Cleveland Street and Meridian Street should be retained. However, this should be monitored and reevaluated if future development in the area occurs.
• School traffic causes vehicles to queue in the West School Access drive, with a more substantial queue forming prior to the afternoon dismissal than the morning arrival period. During the afternoon, observations revealed a queue of two vehicles that spilled back onto Cleveland Street. However, the afternoon queues exist for a very short time, outside of the peak hour, and with little observed impact to traffic operations along Cleveland Street.
• As currently shown on the site plan, Site Access #3, which is on Cleveland Street, is offset by approximately 30 feet from the West School Access. It is recommended that Site Access #3 be shifted to the west to more closely align with the West School Access. With this configuration, the directions of travel for the parking lot that are served by Site Access #3 should be reversed, with two-way traffic recommended for the western parking bay of this lot. This concept is illustrated in Figure 7.
• Each access to the proposed site should be designed to include a minimum of one entering lane and one exiting lane.

Maximum Uses in Existing Zoning District**: RS5**

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
Single- Family Residential (210)	1.5	8.7 D	13 U	125	10	14

Maximum Uses in Existing Zoning District**: SP-R**

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
Single- Family Residential (210)	1.73	-	4 U	39	3	5

Maximum Uses in Proposed Zoning District**: SP-MU**

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
Multi- Family Residential (220)		-	20 U	245	14	29

Maximum Uses in Proposed Zoning District**: SP-MU**

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
Restaurant (931)		-	4,500 SF	405	4	34

Maximum Uses in Proposed Zoning District**: SP-MU**

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
Retail (820)		-	50, 500 SF	4356	103	403

Traffic changes between maximum: **RS5, SP-R and SP-MU**

Land Use (ITE Code)	Acres	FAR/Density	Total Floor Area/Lots/Units	Daily Trips (weekday)	AM Peak Hour	PM Peak Hour
-	-	-		+4,842	+108	+447

METRO SCHOOL BOARD REPORT
Projected student generation existing RS5 & SP district: 4 Elementary 3 Middle 2 High
Projected student generation proposed SP-MU district: 10 Elementary 9 Middle 6 High
The proposed SP-MU zoning district could generate 16 more students than what is typically generated under the existing RS5 and SP zoning district. Students would attend Glenn Elementary School, Jere Baxter Middle School and Maplewood High School. All three schools have been identified as having additional capacity. This information is based upon data from the school board last updated November 2015.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION
Staff recommends approval with conditions and disapproval without all conditions if the associated plan amendment is approved. Staff recommends disapproval if the associated policy amendment is not approved.

CONDITIONS
1. Permitted land uses shall be limited to the following uses:
a. Subdistrict A: up to 20 multi-family residential dwelling units; restaurant, retail, office
b. Subdistrict B: up to 50 multi-family residential dwelling units; restaurant, bed and breakfast inn, hotel, community education, office, retail. All proposed uses are to be within the existing buildings.
c. Subdistrict C: restaurant, bed and breakfast inn, office. All proposed uses are to be within the existing building.
d. Subdistrict D: Accessory uses for principle uses located within Subdistrict C including food and beverage storage, food and beverage production, ancillary office, laundry, and storage of goods and furnishings.
e. A maximum of two restaurants shall be permitted at any one time within the SP.
f. A maximum of 1 bed and breakfast inn with up to 6 rooms within Subdistrict C and a maximum of 1 hotel with up to 35 rooms within Subdistrict B shall be permitted within the SP at any one time.
2. On the corrected preliminary SP plan, remove the parking table provided on the Regulating Plan (sheet 5). Add a note indicating the parking shall be as per the Metro Zoning Ordinance.
3. The proposed new construction closest to the historic buildings shall be decreased in size to provide a transition to the historic buildings. The applicant shall continue to work with the Metro Historic Zoning Commission to determine appropriate heights. Finalized elevations shall be provided with the submittal of the final site plan.
4. Along Cleveland Street, where no historic rock wall is located, provide sidewalks and grass strip consistent with the requirements of the Major and Collector Street Plan (minimum 4 foot grass strip; 8 foot sidewalk).
5. A mandatory referral is required for the proposed alley closures. The mandatory referral shall be approved prior to issuance of any building permits.
6. If a development standard, not including permitted uses, is absent from the SP plan and/or Council approval, the property shall be subject to the standards, regulations and requirements of the MUL-A zoning district as of the date of the applicable request or application. Uses are limited as described in the Council ordinance.
7. The Preliminary SP plan is the site plan and associated documents. If applicable, remove all notes and references that indicate that the site plan is illustrative, conceptual, etc.
8. A corrected copy of the preliminary SP plan incorporating the conditions of approval by Metro Council shall be provided to the Planning Department prior to or with final site plan application.
9. Add the following note to the plan: The final site plan shall depict a minimum 5 foot clear path of travel for pedestrian ways, including public sidewalks, and the location of all existing and proposed obstructions. Prior to the issuance of use and occupancy permits, existing obstructions within the path of travel shall be relocated to provide a minimum of 5 feet of clear access.
10. Minor modifications to the preliminary SP plan may be approved by the Planning Commission or its designee based upon final architectural, engineering or site design and actual site conditions. All modifications shall be consistent with the principles and further the objectives of the approved plan. Modifications shall not be permitted, except through an ordinance approved by Metro Council that increase the permitted density or floor area, add uses not

otherwise permitted, eliminate specific conditions or requirements contained in the plan as adopted through this enacting ordinance, or add vehicular access points not currently present or approved.
11. The requirements of the Metro Fire Marshal's Office for emergency vehicle access and adequate water supply for fire protection must be met prior to the issuance of any building permits.

Approve with conditions and disapprove without all conditions. (8-0-1), Consent Agenda

Resolution No. RS2016-108

"BE IT RESOLVED by The Metropolitan Planning Commission that 2016SP-024-001 is **Approved with conditions and disapproved without all conditions. (8-0-1)**"

CONDITIONS

1. Permitted land uses shall be limited to the following uses:
a. Subdistrict A: up to 20 multi-family residential dwelling units; restaurant, retail, office
b. Subdistrict B: up to 50 multi-family residential dwelling units; restaurant, bed and breakfast inn, hotel, community education, office, retail. All proposed uses are to be within the existing buildings.
c. Subdistrict C: restaurant, bed and breakfast inn, office. All proposed uses are to be within the existing building.
d. Subdistrict D: Accessory uses for principle uses located within Subdistrict C including food and beverage storage, food and beverage production, ancillary office, laundry, and storage of goods and furnishings.
e. A maximum of two restaurants shall be permitted at any one time within the SP.
f. A maximum of 1 bed and breakfast inn with up to 6 rooms within Subdistrict C and a maximum of 1 hotel with up to 35 rooms within Subdistrict B shall be permitted within the SP at any one time.
2. On the corrected preliminary SP plan, remove the parking table provided on the Regulating Plan (sheet 5). Add a note indicating the parking shall be as per the Metro Zoning Ordinance.
3. The proposed new construction closest to the historic buildings shall be decreased in size to provide a transition to the historic buildings. The applicant shall continue to work with the Metro Historic Zoning Commission to determine appropriate heights. Finalized elevations shall be provided with the submittal of the final site plan.
4. Along Cleveland Street, where no historic rock wall is located, provide sidewalks and grass strip consistent with the requirements of the Major and Collector Street Plan (minimum 4 foot grass strip; 8 foot sidewalk).
5. A mandatory referral is required for the proposed alley closures. The mandatory referral shall be approved prior to issuance of any building permits.
6. If a development standard, not including permitted uses, is absent from the SP plan and/or Council approval, the property shall be subject to the standards, regulations and requirements of the MUL-A zoning district as of the date of the applicable request or application. Uses are limited as described in the Council ordinance.
7. The Preliminary SP plan is the site plan and associated documents. If applicable, remove all notes and references that indicate that the site plan is illustrative, conceptual, etc.
8. A corrected copy of the preliminary SP plan incorporating the conditions of approval by Metro Council shall be provided to the Planning Department prior to or with final site plan application.
9. Add the following note to the plan: The final site plan shall depict a minimum 5 foot clear path of travel for pedestrian ways, including public sidewalks, and the location of all existing and proposed obstructions. Prior to the issuance of use and occupancy permits, existing obstructions within the path of travel shall be relocated to provide a minimum of 5 feet of clear access.
10. Minor modifications to the preliminary SP plan may be approved by the Planning Commission or its designee based upon final architectural, engineering or site design and actual site conditions. All modifications shall be consistent with the principles and further the objectives of the approved plan. Modifications shall not be permitted, except through an ordinance approved by Metro Council that increase the permitted density or floor area, add uses not otherwise permitted, eliminate specific conditions or requirements contained in the plan as adopted through this enacting ordinance, or add vehicular access points not currently present or approved.
11. The requirements of the Metro Fire Marshal's Office for emergency vehicle access and adequate water supply for fire protection must be met prior to the issuance of any building permits.